Do Not Track

Lorrie Faith Cranor

October 7, 2014

8-533 / 8-733 / 19-608 / 95-818:
Privacy Policy, Law, and Technology

Carnegie Mellon University
CyLab

isr institute for SOFTWARE RESEARCH

Engineering & Public Policy

CyLab Usable Privacy & Security Laboratory
HTTP://CUPS.CS.CMU.EDU

Today's agenda

- Quiz

- Questions/comments about the readings

- Do not track

- Measuring OBA

- Homework discussion

By the end of class you will be able to:

- Understand the history of Do Not Track and why standardizing it is difficult

- Understand some ways that tracking can be measured

DNT history

- 2007 – Public interest groups proposed Do Not Track (like Do Not Call) to FTC

  – FTC would compile list of trackers, browsers could subscribe to it and block them

- 2009 – Google ad-on to make opt-out cookies permanent, Mozilla ad-on implements DNT header

- 2010 – FTC Chairman Leibowitz tells Senate committee that FTC is considering DNT

See http://paranoia.dubfire.net/2011/01/history-of-do-not-track-header.html and http://donottrack.us for early history

4

DNT history

- 2011 – W3C launches DNT effort, browsers start adding DNT headers

- 2012 – Ad industry pledged to abide by DNT by year end; IE10 announced with DNT on by default, then retracts

- 2013 – After multiple chair turn overs, 8 face-to-face meetings, and still no agreement on the definition of tracking, group has vote on whether to continue; Ad industry backs out

- 2014 – W3C publishes last call working draft

Headlines

- Do Not Track proposal is DOA (July 16, 2013)
  http://money.cnn.com/2013/07/16/technology/do-not-track/

- The Internet's best hope for a Do Not Track standard is falling apart. Here's why.
  (October 11, 2013)
  http://www.washingtonpost.com/blogs/the-switch/wp/2013/10/11/the-internets-best-hope-for-a-do-not-track-standard-is-falling-apart-heres-why/

- How bickering and greed neutered the 'Do Not Track' privacy initiative (May 22, 2014)
  http://www.pcworld.com/article/2158220/do-not-track-oh-what-the-heck-go-ahead.html

- ADVERTISING ALLIANCE TO WEB STANDARDS GROUP: DROP "DO NOT TRACK" (June 23, 2014)
  http://associationsnow.com/2014/06/advertising-alliance-web-standards-group-drop-do-not-track/

- Do-Not-Track Will Benefit Our Whole Industry (August 29, 2014)
  http://www.mediapost.com/publications/article/233197/do-not-track-will-benefit-our-whole-industry.html

- Why We Oppose Do Not Track and How to Fix It: Rules Need to Apply to All Data Collectors -- Including Facebook and Google (July 25, 2014)
  http://adage.com/article/guest-columnists/oppose-track-fix/294319/

What type of protocol?

- List of trackers to block?

- One-way signal from browser to website?

- Two-way communication
  - Browser signals to website
  - Website signals back

Conflicting signals

- What if users have opted out with opt-out cookie or other mechanism but not DNT?

- What if users have opt-in but send DNT=1?

Exceptions

- How can users make an exception for some sites? For some trackers? For some site/tracker combinations?

- How do we prevent sites from tricking users into making an exception or making an exception w/out user consent?

Deliberate choice by user

"Key to that notion of expression is that the signal sent must reflect the user's preference, not the choice of some vendor, institution, site, or network-imposed mechanism outside the user's control; this applies equally to both the general preference and exceptions. The basic principle is that a tracking preference expression is only transmitted when it reflects a deliberate choice by the user. In the absence of user choice, there is no tracking preference expressed."

http://www.w3.org/TR/2014/WD-tracking-dnt-20140424/

CyLab Usable Privacy & Security Laboratory
HTTP://CUPS.CS.CMU.EDU

Carnegie Mellon University
CyLab

isr institute for SOFTWARE RESEARCH

Engineering & Public Policy